

## **MINUTES OF THE 39<sup>th</sup> MEETING WITH THE MDs/CEOs OF REGISTERED VALUERS ORGANISATION HELD ON JUNE 07, 2021 AT 11:00 AM**

The 39<sup>th</sup> Meeting with the MDs/CEOs of Registered Valuers Organization (RVO) took place on June 07, 2021. Dr Navrang Saini, WTM chaired the meeting, held through VC. ACVA did not attend the meeting due to a medical emergency. The list of participants is given at **Annexure-A**.

2. Dr. Navrang Saini welcomed the participants and initiated the discussions.

3. The minutes of the 38<sup>th</sup> meeting with the CEOs/MDs of the RVOs held on 07<sup>th</sup> April, 2021 were noted and confirmed.

**4. Action Taken Report:** The action taken on the minutes of the 38<sup>th</sup> meeting with the CEOs/MDs of the RVOs was reviewed. It was noted that the Board received ATR from 14 RVOs. AIVA and ACVA did not submit ATR for the 38<sup>th</sup> monthly meeting. AIVA requested for some time to submit the ATR due to medical emergency on account of COVID-19, and this was acceded to. **Others were requested to comply with the decisions taken in the earlier meetings regarding submission of ATR.**

**(Action: RVOs)**

5. Status of the following was reviewed:

- a) Dissemination of information about the important decisions taken in the monthly meeting of the CEOs/MDs of RVOs through a section on website of the RVOs.
- b) Mock tests on the website of the RVOs.
- c) Details of faculty members of RVOs imparting educational course on the website of the RVOs.
- d) Inspections of Registered Valuers conducted by RVOs.
- e) Fees charged, if any by RVOs for registering complaints/grievances.
- f) Security audit reports conducted by the RVOs.
- g) Status of redressal of complaints and grievances by the RVOs.

**It was decided and agreed that all RVOs shall complete these matters expeditiously and ensure inspections and consequential actions within reasonable time frame in accordance with their bye- laws.**

**6. Review of Insolvency and Bankruptcy Board of India (Use of Caveats, Limitations, and Disclaimers in Valuation Reports) Guidelines, 2020-** IOV RVF, ICMAI RVO and CEV IAF had provided their feedback while AIIOVF, CVSRTA RVA and RVO ESMA had shared detailed suggestions. **Other RVOs were requested to share their suggestions within the next fortnight so that they can be considered in the next monthly meeting.**

**(Action: RVOs)**

**7. Clarification on credit and Annual Compliance of CPE hours-** Some additional requirements which could be counted for grant of CPE hours was discussed. At the request of some of the RVOs, it was decided that CPE hours for conferences/seminars would be given for the duration of technical sessions. The existing requirements, which could be counted for CPE along with other terms and conditions, which were decided in the previous monthly meetings

were compiled at one place for ease of reference, and these, along with the new requirements as agreed during the meeting are placed at **Annexure-B**.

**8. Discussions on additional requirements for recognition of an RVO-** The following additional requirements were considered: -

- a. An applicant shall satisfy the Authority, through inspection, that it has adequate infrastructure by way of office space, furniture and fixtures, IT facilities, human resources, and training facilities to run the affairs of RVO smoothly.
- b. An RVO shall have at least 100 RVs by the end of first year from the date of recognition and at least 200 RVs at the end of second year-
- c. The existing RVOs shall comply with the requirements by 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2022.

The issue was discussed and the RVOs suggested that for item b, instead of RVs, enrolled members should be considered as sometimes applicants take enrolment and complete the educational course but do not apply for registration as RV. Similarly for item c, additional time to comply with the requirement should be provided till 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2023.

**9. Review of status submission of HYR (Half yearly Report) from Oct 2020- Mar 2021-**

It was noted that 12 RVOs have submitted their HYRs for the period of Oct 2020-Mar 2021. The RVOs which have not submitted the HYR were requested to submit the same at the earliest. ICAI RVO apprised that it will re-submit the HYR as some Registered Valuers have earlier not submitted their HYR due to the current pandemic.

**(Action: RVOs)**

**10. RVOs to publish successful case studies in valuation during CIRP-** RVOs were requested to publish the experience of the Registered Valuers on successful completion of assignments which were of a very challenging nature. **These success stories could inspire others and also be a guide to other RVs, they may, therefore, be published on the website of the RVOs.**

**(Action: RVOs)**

**11. Findings of Peer Review Workshop held on 17<sup>th</sup> February 2021-** Only 7 RVOs had put up the findings of Peer Review Workshop on their websites. **Other RVOs were requested to host the same on their websites.**

**(Action: RVOs)**

**12. Disciplinary Proceedings before the respective RVO-**

It was also observed that in the proceedings in respect of an order of a RVO, it has been stated that the disciplinary proceedings were initiated on the directions of the IBBI, whereas no such directions were given to the RVO. This apart, several established norms were also flaunted. Taking note of the disposal of the disciplinary proceedings in such an aberrant manner, all the RVOs were advised to ensure the following:

- a. The Registered Valuer against whom disciplinary proceedings are initiated cannot be a part of deliberations of the Disciplinary Committee (DC). If he is a member of the DC, he should recuse himself and the Committee should be reconstituted;
- b. All the members of the DC shall be provided the necessary information and the relevant documents before the commencement of the proceedings of the DC.
- c. RVOs should take an independent view on disciplinary matters concerning their members.
- d. The order of the DC must be published on the website of the concerned RVO within 7 days of the issuance of the order as per bye- laws.

**(Action: RVOs)**

### **13. Miscellaneous-**

**a. Guidance note on COVID impact on Valuation-** At the request of the authority, Dr S K Gupta of ICMA RVO, Dr Prashant Sarangi of ICSI RVO, Ms Sarika Singhal of ICAI RVO, Mr Sunit K Gupta of CVSRTA RVA and Mr Sundeep Bansal of CEV IAF volunteered to prepare a note on the impact of COVID-19 on valuation. Others were also invited to contribute towards this initiative.

**(Action: RVOs)**

**b. Concerns regarding the Valuation Examination-** Some RVOs expressed concerns that some of the questions in the examination were irrelevant and some questions also have more than one correct answer. It was clarified that the questions of the Valuation Examination have been prepared by a pool of experts and if there are any specific areas which requires attention, it can be brought to the notice of the Authority. The suggestion regarding conduct of the examination through proctoring would be considered and regarding non availability of slots, it was advised that the same was due to the lockdown and ongoing pandemic, but specific requests may be addressed to the division and these would be examined for possible resolution.

It was decided that the next meeting would be held on 07<sup>th</sup> July, 2021, at 02:30 PM.

The meeting concluded with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

\*\*\*\*\*

## Annexure-A

### List of Participants:

#### IBBI

1.	Dr. Navrang Saini	WTM (In Chair)
2.	Mr. Santosh Kumar Shukla	ED
3.	Mr. Debajyoti Ray Chaudhuri	CGM
4.	Mr. Rajesh Kumar Gupta	CGM
5.	Mr. Pankaj Kumar	AGM
6.	Ms. Namisha Singh	AM
7.	Mr. Deeptanshu Singh	AM
8.	Mr. Abhishek Mittapally	AM
9.	RA Radhika Agarwal	RA

#### RVOs

1.	Ms. Sarika Singhal	CEO, ICAI RVO
2.	Mr. Vinay Goel	MD, IOV RVF
3.	Mr. Rana Ghosh	Chairperson, RVO ESMA
4.	Mr. Prashant Sarangi	CEO, ICSI RVO
5.	Mr. Sundeep Bansal	Representative of CEV IAF
6.	Mr. Sunit Kumar Gupta	CEO, CVSRTA RVA
7.	Mr. Iliyas Shaikh	MD, IIV RVF
8.	Mr. Nitish Singhal	MD, DivyaJyoti Foundation
9.	Mr. Gautam Dodal	Chairman, Nandadeep Valuers Foundation
10.	Mr. Vijay Kumar Gupta	MD, All India Institute of Valuers Foundation
11.	Mr. Umesh Kandade	CEO, PVAI VPO
12.	Dr. S. K. Gupta	MD, ICMAI RVO
13.	Ms. Savita Singh	MD, International Business Valuers Association
14.	Ms. Chetna Agarwal	MD, All India Valuers Association
15.	Mr. Vivek Gupta	MD, Assessors and Registered Valuers Foundation

**Continuing Professional Education by Registered Valuers Organisations**

**I. Existing CPE requirements-**

(As decided in consultation with RVOs in the Monthly meetings)

1. 16 hours of CPE is mandatory for RVs;
2. IBBI shall monitor compliance with the CPE requirements from 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2019
3. The CPE will be conducted through Online mode (vide circular No. IBBI/RVO/032/2020 dated 20<sup>th</sup> March, 2020)
4. To facilitate RVs complete CPE, a member of an RVO can participate in the CPE of another RVO;
5. A valuer member can participate in the CPE programme conducted by any RVO and would be provided credit for the same;
6. One or more RVOs may jointly organise programmes for CPE and the fees may be shared on a pro rata basis;
7. The fees of the CPE organised by an RVO shall only be credited to the bank account of the RVO, who is conducting the program;
8. The manner of taking CPE by a RV shall be flexible in the initial years, it can be spread over a period of one year or may be taken at one instance. The Board will review this after 18 or 24 months;
9. CPE credits should be accorded only for technical sessions conducted during a programme;
10. Only those RVOs which have enrolled members, in compliance with provisions of Rule 12(2)(e), shall organise CPE. To avoid any inconvenience to the RVs who have undertaken CPE before 07<sup>th</sup> January 2021 will be given CPE credit by the RVOs;
11. Only the RVOs which have RVs in the specified asset class shall organise CPE for that asset class;
12. A cap on the number of participants of the educational course and CPE has been kept to ensure the quality of education imparted by the RVOs to 100. The Board may consider review of this provision only if adequate justification is provided for the same;
13. The RVOs can always arrange for webinars with eminent professionals with more than one hundred participants for which CPE credit shall not be available;
14. CPE credits would not be available for more than one such programme in a financial year in case of CPE programme organized by a promoter organization and RVO jointly to participating members of RVOs;
15. CPE credit for a programme attended by an RV cannot be used to comply with the CPE requirements of multiple professions and can be used only once;
16. Compliance report of RVs for CPE will be submitted to the Authority within one month after the close of the Financial Year.

**Proposed Additional Requirements to be counted for credit of CPE hours:**

<b>Sl. No.</b>	<b>Learning Activity in the areas relevant for RVs</b>	<b>Credit Hours</b>
1	Workshops, Conferences, Seminars, Training Programmes, Refresher Programmes, Certificate Courses, Conventions and Symposia and the like	Credit for the duration of technical sessions
2	<b>Acting as faculty</b> in any of the activities in Sl. No. 1	Equivalent to the duration of the activity
3	Publication of article in any national newspaper	4 hours
4	Publication of article in a journal of the Board, an IPA, a RVO, a Professional Institute, or a referred national or international journal bearing ISSN number	4 hours
5	Publication of a Book bearing an ISBN number	16 hours
6	Pass in Limited Insolvency examination	16 hours
7	Pass in Valuation Examination of an asset Class	16 hours